

Dear Masaki,

With the following remarks I will try to assess the matrices presented within the Toya-ko framework for action which allegedly show the contributions of G8 members to health promotion and fighting infectious diseases in developing countries. Especially the information on the German contribution will be reviewed based on the results of our own analysis presented in the Shadow Report for the last UN High Level Meeting in June 2008.

A first general comment is that the reported data do not differentiate between commitments and disbursements. This differentiation should be a minimum feature of reporting as there are often significant differences and only the disbursements represent the real resource flows to developing countries within the respective year.

Second, the information on total health investment lacks presentation of the different funding mechanisms which are included and supposedly sum up the global figure. Thus, it is difficult to verify the global amount given by donors.

Third, not all donors present data on the necessary dimensions of development assistance, i.e. overall resources for health promotion and specific funding for each of the three diseases. Especially Germany presents only figures which lack a differentiation according to these dimensions, but only show mixed numbers which do not allow identifying contributions for individual diseases in order to prove them and for planning purposes. Interestingly, the yearly amount of 300 million euros was originally meant for AIDS alone, but after we presented evidence in the first Shadow Report in 2006 that the real resource mobilization for the HIV response was much lower, the same amount is now officially said to represent funding for all three diseases and health systems support. This appears to be a strategy to "save" the official number in the face of contrasting evidence and to impede that civil society can verify it.

Fourth, the G8 and other donors should present publicly the background information on which their figures in the tables are based. This means for instance to make available a list of all bilaterally financed health-related projects including the main data required for reporting to CRS of DAC/OECD and quantifying the components for each of the three diseases within wider health projects. This would permit to calculate and verify the financial quantities earlier than using the databases of DAC/OECD, which are completed and made available usually a whole year after the end of the reference year. Therefore we still do not have data for the year 2007. Furthermore, there should be a systematic reporting on contributions to health-relevant UN Organizations, as well as the shares of health and the diseases within the overall expenditure or budget of these organizations.

Fifth, without appropriate targets for each G8 country it is impossible to evaluate the performance of their funding for health promotion. Thus, the continuation of working on an adequate consensus on financial targets must be a priority, as we discussed in Mexico in the satellite meeting organized by Global SIDA from Spain.

Therefore, I developed a reporting format that tries to overcome the above mentioned shortcomings. In the annexes you will find these charts with the respective data for Germany and the development cooperation administered by the European Community. The data resulted from the analyses I did on behalf of Action against AIDS Germany and which are presented in the recent Shadow report. Additionally, I made an update and refinement of some calculations which led to minor changes in some amounts. For the contributions to the Global Fund I used now the pledged and paid real amounts in euros instead of calculating them on the basis of OECD reference exchange rates. For computing the participation of Germany in financing the EC ODA I used the newest data given in the DAC/OECD databases. In this case the share of the EU-15 countries diminishes slightly over time because of the rather small but increasing contributions of new member states that joined since 2002. As a result some

amounts differ from the figures presented in the Shadow Report by fractions of a million. Furthermore, the BACKUP-Initiative is shown separately in the row for other funding mechanisms.

There should be separate charts for health promotion as a whole, and the three diseases or even other specific health problems. In the annex I include only the charts on health and HIV, as we did not carry out a complete analysis on TB and malaria up to now.

The sources of the data are as explained in the Shadow report. For the analysis of the bilateral funding of Germany and EC the CRS database of DAC/OECD was used. The amount for bilateral HIV funding includes not only specific projects but also HIV components in reproductive health interventions and sector-wide programs based on an estimated percentage share (see details in annex 5). The data for EC are directly used to calculate the respective participation of Germany in co-financing these funding streams managed by EC.

The necessary data for IDA/World Bank and the Global Fund can be found on the web-sites of these financing institutions. In the case of World Bank there is a database showing the HIV components of health programs, but as to my knowledge this is not the case for malaria and TB components, thus making it much more difficult to get these data. With regard to the relevant UN organizations reporting on country contributions differs and in some case like WHO no clear data are available. Then the data have to be researched in statistical systems of each donor, for instance the budgets of relevant ministries. The share of expenditure allotted to HIV and health programmes has to be researched in annual reports and similar documents. For these funding institutions a more standardized and up-dated reporting system would contribute to make work much easier. Annex 6 is showing the relevant UN organizations with the respective data available to me, mainly from the research for the last Shadow Report.

Presenting the information according to these formats would allow us to verify the contributions of each country and hold governments accountable. When donors would present additionally the relevant project data destined for reporting to CRS database the evaluation by civil society could be done in a timely manner.

In the current reporting of Germany it is impossible to quantify and verify the “related health system strengthening” because there is no definition of this term and the respective amounts are not shown in the available information. It is also difficult to calculate the malaria and TB components in wider health programs in the case of bilateral cooperation as well as in the co-financed programs of EC, WB/IDA and UN organizations. However, the specific programs for malaria and TB within bilateral cooperation are rather small and amounted in 2006 only to a total of 6.7 million US\$ or 5.4 million euros (commitments) and 5.1 million US\$ or 4.0 million euros (disbursements). If we add this respective numbers to the bilateral programmes and components shown in annex 1 we see that real disbursements for 2006 were in all probability much lower than the reported figure of 131.9 million euros. On the other hand, the exceptionally high commitments for health programs in 2006 lead to a number which is actually higher than the reported one in that specific year. This refers us again to the necessity to demand a more differentiated reporting of financial information.

One further point I have to make: We should also take into account the overall ODA, especially the ODA/GNI ratio of donor countries and aspects of aid effectiveness including tied aid and imposition of donor-led approaches.

I look forward for further discussions on these important topics

With best regards

Joachim Ruppel

Germany: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for the Global Response to the HIV Crisis, Million US\$

Financing Mechanism	Direct / through EU	Commitments			Disbursements		
		2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	---	61.9	177.0	na	55.7	75.9	na
Calculated. Share of EC Programmes	---	19.5	21.9	na	18.2	23.0	na
Calculated Share of IDA-Programmes	---	11.3	4.8	22.3	12.0	6.1	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations (based on HIV share of UN-organizations' expenditure or budget)	direct	16.6	15.3	na	16.6	15.3	na
	Through EU	6.2	4.5	na	6.2	4.5	na
	Total	22.9	19.9	na	22.9	19.9	na
Contributions to Global Fund	direct	59.7	51.1	67.7	59.7	51.1	67.7
	Through EU	9.5	14.6	18.4	9.5	14.6	18.4
	Total	69.3	65.7	86.0	69.3	65.7	86.0
Contributions to African Development Fund	---	2.9	2.4	na	3.1	3.1	na
Others: BACKUP-Initiative	---	0.0	6.6	na	2.5	0.7	na
Total Contribution		187.8	298.2	na	183.8	194.2	na
Share of Development Cooperation managed by EC		23.66%	21.44%	20.90%	23.66%	21.44%	20.90%

Germany: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for the Global Response to the HIV Crisis, Million Euro

Financing Mechanism	Direct / through EU	Commitments			Disbursements		
		2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	---	49.8	141.0	na	44.8	60.5	na
Calculated. Share of EC Programmes	---	15.7	17.5	na	14.7	18.3	na
Calculated Share of IDA-Programmes	---	9.1	3.9	16.3	9.7	4.8	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations (based on HIV share of UN-organizations' expenditure or budget)	direct	13.4	12.2	na	13.4	12.2	na
	Through EU	5.0	3.6	na	5.0	3.6	na
	Total	18.4	15.8	na	18.4	15.8	na
Contributions to Global Fund ¹⁾	direct	47.6	41.8	50.5	47.6	41.8	50.5
	Through EU	8.0	11.6	12.1	8.0	11.6	12.1
	Total	55.5	53.4	62.6	55.5	53.4	62.6
Contributions to African Development Fund	---	2.3	1.9	na	2.5	2.5	na
Others: BACKUP-Initiative	---	0.0	5.2	na	2.0	0.5	na
Total Contribution		150.9	238.6	na	147.6	155.8	na

¹⁾ For contributions to the Global Fund the real pledged and paid amounts in euro are shown, whereas all other amounts are calculated on the basis of yearly OECD exchange rates

European Community: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for the Global Response to the HIV Crisis, Million US\$

Financing Mechanism	Commitments			Disbursements		
	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	82.2	102.2	na	77.1	107.2	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations	26.4	21.0	na	26.4	21.0	na
Contributions to Global Fund	40.3	67.9	87.8	40.3	67.9	87.8
Others:						
Total Contribution	149.0	191.2		143.9	196.2	

European Community: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for the Global Response to the HIV Crisis, Million Euro

Financing Mechanism	Commitments			Disbursements		
	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	66.2	81.4	na	62.0	85.4	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations	21.2	16.8	na	21.2	16.8	na
Contributions to Global Fund	33.6	54.1	58.0	33.6	54.1	58.0
Others:						
Total Contribution	121.1	152.3		116.9	156.3	

**Germany: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for Health Promotion and Services,
Million US\$**

Financing Mechanism	Direct / through EU	Commitments			Disbursements		
		2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	---	199.2	462.9	na	212.7	246.3	na
Calculated. Share of EC Programmes	---	157.8	123.6	na	83.3	125.2	na
Calculated Share of IDA-Programmes	---	41.7	47.8	na	44.3	59.7	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations (based on HIV share of UN-organizations' expenditure or budget)	direct	42.8	44.4	na	42.8	44.4	na
	Through EU	0.0	0.0	na	0.0	0.0	na
	Total	42.8	44.4	na	42.8	44.4	na
Contributions to Global Fund	direct	103.0	88.1	123.8	103.0	88.1	123.8
	Through EU	16.5	25.1	31.6	16.5	25.1	31.6
	Total	119.4	113.2	155.4	119.4	113.2	155.4
Contributions to African Development Fund	---	13.0	7.3	na	14.1	9.7	na
Others: BACKUP-Initiative	---	0.0	11.3	na	4.2	1.1	na
Total Contribution		573.9	810.5	na	520.8	599.7	na
Share of Development Cooperation managed by EC		23.66%	21.44%	20.90%	23.66%	21.44%	20.90%

**Germany: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for Health Promotion and Services,
Million Euro**

Financing Mechanism	Direct / through EU	Commitments			Disbursements		
		2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	---	160.3	368.8	na	171.1	196.2	na
Calculated. Share of EC Programmes	---	127.0	98.5	na	67.0	99.7	na
Calculated Share of IDA-Programmes	---	33.5	38.1	na	35.6	47.6	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations (based on HIV share of UN-organizations' expenditure or budget)	direct	34.4	35.4	na	34.4	35.4	na
	Through EU	0.0	0.0	na	0.0	0.0	na
	Total	34.4	35.4	na	34.4	35.4	na
Contributions to Global Fund ¹⁾	direct	82.0	72.0	87.0	82.0	72.0	87.0
	Through EU	13.7	20.0	20.9	13.7	20.0	20.9
	Total	95.7	92.0	107.9	95.7	92.0	107.9
Contributions to African Development Fund	---	10.5	5.8	na	11.4	7.7	na
Others: BACKUP-Initiative	---	0.0	9.0	na	3.4	0.9	na
Total Contribution		461.4	647.5	na	418.7	479.6	na

¹⁾ For contributions to the Global Fund the real pledged and paid amounts in euro are shown, whereas all other amounts are calculated on the basis of yearly OECD exchange rates

**European Community: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for Health
Promotion and Services, Million US\$**

Financing Mechanism	Commitments			Disbursements		
	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	667.0	576.4	na	352.0	583.9	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations	0.0	0.0	na	0.0	0.0	na
Contributions to Global Fund	69.6	117.2	151.4	69.6	117.2	151.4
Others:						
Total Contribution	736.5	693.6		421.5	701.0	

**European Community: Estimate of Total ODA-Resources mobilized for Health
Promotion and Services, Million Euro**

Financing Mechanism	Commitments			Disbursements		
	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
Bilateral Programmes and Components	536.6	459.2	na	283.2	465.2	na
Contributions to relevant UN-Organizations	0.0	0.0	na	0.0	0.0	na
Contributions to Global Fund	58.0	93.3	100.0	58.0	93.3	100.0
Others:						
Total Contribution	594.6	552.6		341.2	558.5	

**Bilateral ODA-Resources for the International Response to the HIV-Epidemic,
Million US\$**

Subsectors	Total Amounts				HIV-Share (%)	Amounts for HIV-Interventions			
	Commitments		Disbursements			Commitments		Disbursements	
	2005	2006	2005	2006		2005	2006	2005	2006
Specif. HIV-Interventions	43.6	136.0	<i>34.2</i>	<i>55.1</i>	100%	43.6	136.0	<i>34.2</i>	<i>55.1</i>
Reproductive Health	38.0	97.4	<i>33.4</i>	<i>35.9</i>	25%	9.5	24.4	<i>8.3</i>	<i>9.0</i>
Sector-wide Programmes	88.4	166.6	<i>10.0</i>	<i>118.4</i>	10%	8.8	16.7	<i>1.0</i>	<i>11.8</i>
Other Health Problems	32.1	65.6	<i>13.6</i>	<i>38.4</i>	0%	0.0	0.0	<i>0.0</i>	<i>0.0</i>
Unspecified	---	---	<i>122.0</i>	---	10%	---	---	<i>12.2</i>	---
Total US\$	202.1	465.6	213.1	247.8	---	61.9	177.0	55.7	75.9
Total Euro	162.6	370.9	171.5	197.4	---	49.8	141.0	44.8	60.5

1) Available data for disbursements in 2005 do not allow to distinguish between sector-wide programmes and projects directed at other health problems. Therefore the estimated share für HIV components within the former is applied for all health programmes which are not oriented primarily to HIV control and reproductive health. Due to missing descriptions it is also impossible to check the purpose indications. (resulting figures in italics).

Note: Totals in this table may differ from health sector totals because of addition of identified HIV projects localized in other sectors.

Germany: Contributions to relevant UN Organizations for financing the International HIV Response, in US\$

Organization	Imputable contribution by Germany to HIV Response			Total contributions by Germany			Share of Organizations' expenditure or budget allocated for HIV&AIDS		
	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
World Health Organization	3.4	3.6		38.5	40.2		8.8%	8.9%	
UNAIDS	2.5	1.3	2.4	2.5	1.3	2.4	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
UNICEF	0.5	0.3		5.8	5.7		8.0%	5.5%	
UNFPA	5.9	5.9		19.1	19.5		30.8%	30.2%	
UNDP	1.7	1.5		32.1	33.6		5.4%	4.5%	
World Food Programme	2.7	2.8		28.6	28.9		9.3%	9.6%	
Total	16.6	15.3		126.6	129.1				

Germany: Contributions to Health-relevant UN Organizations, in US\$

Organization	Imputable Contribution of Germany to Health Promotion			Contributions of Germany			Share for ODA to Health Promotion in Developing Countries		
	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007	2005	2006	2007
World Health Organization	27.0	28.1		38.5	40.2		70.0%	70.0%	70.0%
UNAIDS	2.5	1.3	2.4	2.5	1.3	2.4	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
UNICEF	1.6	3.2	na	5.8	5.7	na	27.0%	56.5%	na
UNFPA	11.7	11.8	na	19.1	19.5	na	61.5%	60.3%	na
UNDP	0.0	0.0	na	32.1	33.6	na	0.0%	0.0%	na
World Food Programme	0.0	0.0	na	28.6	28.9	na	0.0%	0.0%	na
Total	42.8	44.4	na	126.6	129.1	na			